

## **POLICE ADVISORY AND REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES**

Chairperson Rosa Mar called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. on July 19, 2018 at the E.V. Davidson Community Center located at 3124 Wilson Avenue, Knoxville, TN 37914.

**Attending Committee:** Robbie Arrington, Ann Barker, Rosa Mar, Robert Gibson, Frank Shanklin, Jered Croom

**Not Attending:** LaKenya Middlebrook

**Attending PARC Staff:** Clarence L. Vaughn, III, PARC Executive Director, Ola Blackmon-McBride Executive Assistant

**Attending KPD/City of Knoxville Staff:** Chief Eve Thomas, Captain Ronald Green, Sergeant Jonathan Chadwell, Sergeant Amanda Bunch, Attorney Ron Mills, Deborah Thomas, & Avice Reid, Sr. Director of Community Relations

### **INTRODUCTION**

Chairperson Mar welcomed guests to the second quarter meeting of the Police Advisory & Review Committee, held at the E.V. Davidson Community Center. Chairperson Mar commented on Dr. Elvyn Davidson's contributions to the community of Knoxville as a prominent African-American medical practitioner and surgeon. Chairperson Mar also recognized Ms. Candice Canty and Beth Field for their assistance in confirming the meeting space.

Chairperson Mar recognized the newly appointed Chief of Police for the Knoxville Police Department, Chief Eve Thomas.

Chairperson Mar reminded everyone that if they wish to speak during open forum, to please sign up on the sheet at the front entry table. Speaking times will be limited to 3 minutes per person.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Chairperson Mar asked if committee members had reviewed the 1<sup>st</sup> Quarter meeting minutes, which took place on April 19, 2018. There were no changes and 1<sup>st</sup> Quarter meeting minutes were approved.

### **SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS – Robbie Arrington**

- April 3, 2018** The Executive Director was asked to serve as a guest speaker for "Real Talk", which is a small group discussion held at Vine Middle School under the direction of Assistant Principal Clarence Swearingen. The group focuses on ways to encourage and enlighten young males to enhance their performance in school and throughout the community.
- April 16, 2018** The Executive Director was invited by English Instructor Jessica Dean of AmeriCorps VISTA to speak to students at Pellissippi State Community College. The discussion outlined the history and impact of PARC, and we focused on areas of concern from community members regarding interactions with law enforcement officers.
- April 25, 2018** The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for Mount Zion Baptist Church's "Legacy Conversation". The conversation was targeted at sharing information about PARC to young adults and adolescents. We discussed the impact of community involvement in matters of law enforcement and public safety.
- May 17, 2018** The Executive Director invited to appear on the "Hubert Smith Show", which airs on the Community Television Network. The invitation served as an opportunity to share information about PARC and current areas of focus. Mr. Hubert Smith also gave a detailed background of PARC's history and its continued service to the City of Knoxville.
- May 30, 2018** The Executive Director and guest panelists provided the Cultural Competency Training for the Knoxville Police Department Recruit Class. The training session composed of discussions concerning bias, diversity, and effective ways to improve and enhance relationships with community members.
- June 23, 2018** The Executive Director served as a moderator and guest speaker at the first annual "Ujima Rally", which was held at the Alex Haley Heritage Square. The Executive Director along with guest panelists Andre Canty and Claudia Cabrillo shared information about cultural competence and ways to engage diverse communities.
- June 29, 2018** The Executive Director served as a break out discussion leader on the topic of financial literacy. The Executive Director shared information concerning professional development and money management to attendees of the "Save our Sons" Summit held at Pellissippi Community College.

Attendees were reminded everyone that if anyone would like PARC to speak to his or her organization, please call Clarence Vaughn at the PARC office. The PARC office telephone number is 865-215-3869 and it can also be found in the Informational Brochure located at the entrance table.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT**

Executive Director Clarence Vaughn gave his second quarter report for 2018.

**AUDIT OF DISCIPLINE PROCESS**

The Committee audits all completed investigations from the Internal Affairs Unit of the Knoxville Police Department. The results of the second quarter audits were as follows:

Total of Cases Audited by the Police Advisory and Review Committee was two IAU Cases:

Officers Disciplined	3
Civilian Employees Disciplined	0

<b><u>Disciplines Imposed</u></b>	<b><u>Number of Officers</u></b>	<b><u>Number of Civilian Employees</u></b>
Suspension	1	
Verbal Counseling	2	

The Police Advisory and Review Committee and the Executive Director concurred with Internal Affairs’s conclusions on each case reviewed. The Committee asked for additional information on one of the two cases reviewed. After reviewing the additional information provided, the Committee concurred with the findings of the Internal Affairs Unit.

**AUDITS OF KPD POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

Reviewed the following ordinances, policies, and procedures as result of the Executive Director’s evaluation of the Internal Affairs Investigations and complaints brought to the Executive Director:

- General Order 1.22 (Use of Discretion)
- General Order 1.60 (Response to Resistance/Use of Force)
- General Order 1.41 (Bias Based Policing)
- General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment)
- General Order 4.6 (Preliminary & Follow-Up Investigations Procedures)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.02 Neglect of Duty
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.19 (Unbecoming Conduct)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.24 (Use of Force)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.04 (Conduct – General)
- Standard Operating Procedure 3.00 (Courtesy)
- Standard Operating Procedure 3.01 (Responding to Calls)

**ADVOCACY (STRENGTHENING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CITIZENS AND THE KPD)**

- The Executive Director conducted a ride-along with a Knoxville Police Department officer. The experience allowed for the Executive Director to have a realistic view of issues and threats faced by law enforcement on a daily basis.
- The Executive Director attends awards and promotion ceremonies held by the Knoxville Police Department. The activities are to recognize the efforts of Knoxville Police Department officers and their service to the City of Knoxville.
- The Executive directed provided Cultural Competency Training to the Knoxville Police Department’s newly selected Recruit Class. The Cultural Competency Training directly focused on effective ways in which officers can build strong community relationships and become aware of biases that impact our community.

**COMMUNITY OUTREACH**

- The Executive Director continues to meet with citizens and community groups to discuss concerns and complaints to develop plans for successful resolutions.
- The Executive Director served as a guest speaker at Vine Middle School for the “Real Talk” empowerment session hosted by Assistant Principal Clarence Swearngen. The session included 6<sup>th</sup> through 8<sup>th</sup> grade students whom meet prior to their first class to discuss leadership development and ways to empower themselves.
- The Executive Director was asked to share information about PARC and our service to the City of Knoxville to students of Pellissippi State Community College. Students whom had interest in Social and Criminal Justice were invited to attend the discussion

## **NETWORKING**

- The Executive Director was contacted by the City of Austin's Office of Police Monitor to discuss PARC's history and structural identity. The Executive Director shared information about PARC's formation and the process in which PARC independently reviews citizen complaints and closed Internal Affairs Unit cases.
- The Executive Director harnessed relationships with the University of Tennessee College of Psychology, in which PARC was provided an intervention plan from University of Tennessee Doctorial students. The intervention plan concentrated on PARC's community outreach and stakeholder's perception of rendered services.
- The Executive Director successfully complete the City Ambassadors Program hosted by Russ Jensen and Chip Barry. The program highlighted various departments, programs, and services provided by the City of Knoxville. Participants are current City of Knoxville employees, and each participant benefit by extending their internal network amongst fellow employees.

Chairperson Mar reminded everyone that if any person wanted to speak at Open Forum to please sign up on the sheet located at the back table.

## **PARC SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **Audio/Video Subcommittee – Frank Shanklin**

Of the (2) IAU Cases reviewed by PARC Audio/Video Subcommittee, we submit the provided findings:

#### **File #1 IAU Case #17-2777**

The Internal Affairs Unit Case reviewed resulted in multiple infractions not based upon the original complaint. The infractions were related to officers failing to activate their wireless microphones. During an altercation, the officer involved failed to activate her wireless microphone. An accompanying officer was noted for activating their wireless microphone prior to arriving to the scene, yet the wireless microphone deactivated once he began talking with the suspect in custody. The deactivation was potentially due to an issue with the officer's belt microphone, which continued to make a buzzing noise.

#### **File #2 IAU Case #17-2789**

The Internal Affairs Unit Case resulted in an officer's wireless microphone deactivating while they engaged a potential suspect. The officer involved properly activated her wireless microphone and the microphone cut off during her conversation with the suspect. Due to the officer working an extended shift, there is a potential chance that her wireless microphone was not completely charged. The wireless microphone used by the officer was due for an equipment update, in which the officer was provided with updated equipment.

## **SUMMARY**

The Knoxville Police Department's General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment) details that Officers shall turn on their audio and video equipment when they are out of their patrol unit on a call-for-service in the event audio is needed to substantiate or assist with documentation of their law enforcement duties, i.e., domestic disturbance, etc. It should be remembered that the purpose of the in-car video equipment is to monitor all contacts with a person in the community in all situations possible.

We would also like to mention that the Knoxville Police Department requires Sergeants to review officers' audio and visual footage twice per month to ensure that their wireless microphones are operating properly.

### **Racial Profiling Subcommittee – Robert Gibson**

There was one alleged racial profiling case received by PARC during the 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter.

#### **Case #1 Summary:**

PARC received a complaint from a concerned citizen in reference to an alleged incident of Racial Profiling involving a Knoxville Police Department officer. The complainant stated that he was driving on Middlebrook Pike and was followed by the officer. The complainant continued to drive to a familiar location, in which he was stopped by the officer. The complainant was cited for "Disregarding the Stop Sign" and "Illegal Window Tinting". The complainant was alleging that he was stop and followed due to being an African American male, and he stated that he is very fearful of having any future interactions with the Knoxville Police Department.

**Conclusion:**

The initial complaint received involved allegations of Racial Profiling by an officer of the Knoxville Police Department. After further review of the officer’s audio and video recordings regarding the incident, it was noted that the complainant was informed about his violations of Failing to Stop and Illegal Window Tinting. The complainant was seen failing to stop on multiple occasions. The complainant’s window tint was visibly lower than the lawful percentage, which made it difficult for the officer to view inside of the vehicle. Therefore, the conclusion of the complaint identified that the officer’s actions were deemed to be lawful and proper. In addition, the officer did not provide any evidence to confirm that Racial Profiling or Bias Based Policing occurred during the traffic stop.

**KPD Policy and Procedure Reviewed:**

**General Order 1.41 Bias Based Policing**

**I. Policy**

It is the policy of the Knoxville Police Department that we are committed to preserving the peace and maintaining order in the City of Knoxville by practicing bias-free policing and respecting the rights and dignity of all citizens.

**II. Definition**

Bias Based Profiling - The practice of stopping, detaining or searching a person based solely upon a common trait or a group that includes but is not limited to their race, color ethnicity, age, gender sexual orientation, religion, economic status or any other identifiable group characteristic.

**Operations Subcommittee – Robert Gibson and Ann Barker**

Ms. Ann Barker reported on the quarterly totals of the 2018 cases, received and reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period April 1, 2018 through June 30, 2018.

Total Cases for the Quarter	18
Cases Closed in the Quarter	15
<b>Resolution of Cases Closed for the Quarter</b>	
Executive Director	10
Mediation: Executive Director & KPD	1
Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	1
KPD	3
<b>Total Cases Resolved</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Total Cases Pending for the Quarter</b>	
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases <b>Referred</b> to IAU for the Quarter	0
IAU Completed Cases <b>Reviewed</b> by PARC for the Quarter	2
IAU Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter	0
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases sent to IAU	0
IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases	0

Mr. Robert Gibson reported on the year to date totals on cases reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period of January 1, 2018 through June 30, 2018

Total Cases for the Year	41
Cases Closed for the Year	40*
<b>Resolution of Cases Closed for the Year</b>	
Executive Director	23
Mediation: Executive Director & KPD	1
Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	5
KPD	11
<b>Total Cases Resolved</b>	<b>40*</b>
<b>Total Cases Pending</b>	
	3
<b>PARC Initiated Cases <u>Referred</u> to IAU for the Year</b>	
	1
<b>IAU Completed Cases <u>Reviewed</u> by PARC for the Year</b>	
	6
<b>IAU Completed Referral Action Forms <u>Reviewed</u> by PARC</b>	
	2
<b>IAU Initiated Referrals and Cases</b>	
	0

*\*Indicates that 2 cases from 2017 have been closed in the current year*

**TRAINING SESSION: KPD**

Sgt. Jonathan Chadwell, KPD Internal Affairs Unit provided an overview of the Response Resistance Analysis and Vehicle Flight Analysis for 2017. Officers engaged in 164 case of documented force of individuals who were actively resisting arrests. A total of 10,225 were arrested for the year. Therefore, this number represents only 1.6 % of the total arrests.

Knoxville Police Department received 247,425 calls for assistance in 2017. This represents an increase from 2016.

The department went over three years without an officer involved shooting. Prior to 2017, the last shooting occurred in July 2017. The department experienced two officers involved shootings in 2017. One occurred in November 2017 and December 2017.

Vehicle flight analysis reflects 34 vehicle flight reports for 2017, a decrease of six from 2016. There was an increase of officers imitated reports, 18 in 2016 and 51 in 2017. Officers “Initiated Reports” are when a vehicle flees but an officer terminate the pursuit due to lack of policy. Sgt. Chadwell contributes the increase to better training in this area.

Sgt. Chadwell addressed questions from the Committee regarding the policies on pursuits.

**CASE MATTERS TO BE ADDRESSED BY THE COMMITTEE**

PARC committee member Ann Barker pointed out that the officer in Case #2 had been working an extended shift and her microphone wasn’t fully charged. She noted that previous cases had occurred during overtime shifts. Therefore, she questioned whether this contributed to the microphone issue. Chief Thomas reported that she is in discussion with the Mayor to find ways to eliminate the extended shifts. KPD is in the process of hiring new officers and are exploring options for new work schedules.

Committee member Robbie Arrington asked the question “How long does the microphone battery last? Chief Thomas responded that it depends upon how long it is activated. She noted that there are chargers in the patrol car.

Jered Croom, PARC committee, asked why the officers were not charged with a crime in Case #1? Chief Thomas noted that the Tennessee Bureau of Investigation (TBI) investigated this case. The officer was not charged with a crime and the District Attorney (DA) Office declined to press charges. However, KPD did impose discipline actions. The officer was suspended for four (4) weeks without pay and required to participate in 90 days of extensive training.

### **CITIZENS ASKED TO APPEAR BEFORE PARC**

Chief Eve Thomas addressed everyone. Chief Thomas noted that she is “ecstatic and more than blessed to be chosen for this opportunity.” She noted that she stands on the shoulders of the men and women of the Knoxville Police Department and supervisors. The work they do every day is what matters. “I am here to promote that work and make sure they have the tools, trainings and everything they need to provide the best services to the community.” Chief Eve Thomas shared her planned vision for the Knoxville Police Department and her commitment to continuing efforts made by Former Chief of Police, David Rausch in building relationships with the community

### **OPEN FORUM**

The following citizens addressed the Committee with concerns:

**Alontro Simpson:** Mr. Simpson addressed the committee and noted that he had been doing research on a case that involved a KPD officer. He expressed concerns that the policies and procedures that had been set up to protect us, they are not. Executive Director Vaughn noted that any case involving the officer could not be addressed due to pending litigation.

**Sonia Uriarte:** Ms. Uriarte expressed concerns as it relates to the Latino community and 287G and ICE. Chief Thomas explained that KPD is not involved with the 287G and ICE. This is handled by the Knox County Sheriff Department.

**Rick Roach:** Mr. Roach asked Chief Thomas to define the role between ICE and School Resource Officers (SRO). Chief Thomas again reminded the audience that 287G and ICE is handled by Knox County Sheriff Department. She encouraged Mr. Roach to reach out to Sheriff-Elect Spangler for more information and clarification.

**Evone Stephens:** Ms. Stephens noted that she was here tonight on behalf of the South Knoxville community. She praised former Chief Rausch for his service to youth and encouraged Chief Thomas to continue to be pro-active with youths.

**Jim Golden:** Mr. Golden expressed concerns about the children’s safety in his neighborhood. He further shared concerns that related to a fire at his home. Mr. Golden was informed that the fire issue was outside of the scope of PARC but Chief Thomas volunteered to share with the Fire Chief a couple of a letter/document Mr. Golden distributed.

**Tina Ahrens:** Ms. Ahrens shared with the committee information about a new program, Volunteers for Recovery. This program can serve 28 men. It is a re-entry program for alcohol and other drugs to help men become re-established. They pay \$125 per week which includes room and board, hygiene and transportation.

### **COMMUNITY UPDATES**

The City of Knoxville Community Relations Department Save our Sons (SOS) is hosting its 2<sup>nd</sup> Community Conversation on August 16<sup>th</sup> at the Wesley House in Mechanicsville.

One Knox Legacy Coalition, a voter’s empowerment group will be at the Walter P. Taylor Homecoming on Saturday, July 28<sup>th</sup> to register voters.

The next NAACP meeting is August 2<sup>nd</sup> at 5:30 p.m. The meeting will be at the Beck Cultural Center.

Councilwoman Gwen McKenzie invited individuals to attend a meeting about the Magnolia Avenue Streetscapes Project meeting from 6-7 p.m. on July 23<sup>rd</sup> at the O’Conner Center.

A mayoral candidate’s forum will be held on Friday, July 20<sup>th</sup> at 6 p.m., at Pellissippi on Magnolia Avenue.

The meeting adjourned.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Clarence L. Vaughn III, Executive Director