

**POLICE ADVISORY AND REVIEW COMMITTEE
MINUTES**

Chairperson Rosa Mar called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. on April, 24, 2019 at the Regal Cinemas Headquarters, 101 E. Blount Avenue, Knoxville, Tennessee.

Attending Committee: Rosa Mar, Robert Gibson, Ann Barker, LaKenya Middlebrook, Robbie Arrington, Frank Shanklin
Jered Croom

Not Attending:

Attending PARC Staff: Clarence L. Vaughn, III, PARC Executive Director

Attending KPD/City of Knoxville Staff: Chief Eve Thomas, Deputy Chief Kenny Miller, Captain Anthony Willis, Captain David Powell, Lieutenant Jerry Armstrong, Sergeant Jonathan Chadwell, Sergeant Amanda Bunch, Attorney Ronald Mills, Deborah Thomas, & Avice Reid, Sr.
Director of Community Relations

INTRODUCTION

Chairperson Rosa Mar expressed thanks to Robbie Arrington and Regal Cinemas Corporate Office for hosting the 2019 1st Quarter PARC Meeting. Chairperson Mar also noted that this was Mr. Arrington's last meeting as a member of the PARC. The Chairperson thanked Mr. Arrington for his service and commitment and presented him a Certificate of Appreciation on behalf of PARC.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairperson Mar asked if committee members had reviewed minutes of the 4th Quarter meeting held on January 24, 2019 at the Knox County Public Defender's Community Law Office. There were no changes. The 4th Quarter meeting minutes were approved.

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS & EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT – Clarence Vaughn

Executive Director Vaughn gave a report of the 1st Quarter speaking engagements and Executive Director's report.

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS

- January 4, 2019** The Executive Director was asked to serve as a guest speaker for a group of student leaders who attends Lincoln Memorial University. The discussion was centered around civic leadership and volunteerism. Students were encouraged to become more engaged and involved in their local communities by volunteering their time and talents.
- January 9, 2019** The Executive Director presented at the Neighborhood Advisory Council Meeting on the history and purpose of the Police Advisory and Review Committee. Members received information about PARC and upcoming activities. In addition, the Executive Director and Neighborhood Coordinator shared information about their plans of conducting a Neighborhood Safety Awareness series throughout the City of Knoxville.
- January 28, 2019** The Executive Director along with Rosa Mar, PARC Chair, Avice Reid, Senior Community Relations Director, and Lt. Jerry Armstrong, Knoxville Police Department Internal Affairs Unit met with elected officials and community leaders from the City of Chattanooga to discuss the structure and creation of civilian oversight. The meeting discussions focused on the most effective methods used to establish an effective and transparent civilian oversight body, and the significance of having a working relationship with law enforcement agencies.
- February 11, 2019** The Executive Director was invited to share information about PARC with members of the Cold

Springs Neighborhood Association. Members were provided with information detailing the process of a citizen complaint and services offered by PARC in matters of public safety and awareness.

- February 11, 2019** The Executive Director served as a panelist for the private screening of the highly acclaimed film titled “13” hosted by YOKE Ministries, which spoke about systemic racism in relation to mass incarceration and criminal penalties. The Executive Director participated in a discussion following the viewing that was directed at identifying ways to advocate for more awareness of issues that impact communities of color.
- February 18, 2019** The Executive Director was invited by members of the Sigma Gamma Rho Sorority, Inc. on the campus of the University of Tennessee to serve as a panelist at the private screening of “The Sandra Bland Story”. The screening showcased the tragic and controversial incident involving the death of Sandra Bland. The discussion outlined the purpose of PARC and the impacts in which civilian oversight bodies can have. We also discussed the importance for citizens to “Survive the Interaction” and to “Comply to Complain later”.
- February 20, 2019** The Executive Director and Chief Eve Thomas, Knoxville Police Department, represented the City of Knoxville at the House of Representatives, Criminal Justice Sub-Committee Meeting in Nashville, Tennessee. Both the Executive Director and Chief Eve Thomas testified at the meeting and shared information about the success of PARC and its working relationship with the Knoxville Police Department.
- February 27, 2019** The Executive Director led a book discussion on behalf of the Knox County Public Library monthly “Books Sandwiched In” series. The book titled, “The Black and The Blue”, shared the experience of a former African-American police officer who provided his experiences of issues relating to mass incarceration, racial profiling, and police involved shootings. The primary focus of the discussion topic was to encourage more conversations about issues that negatively impact marginalized communities.
- March 2, 2019** The Executive Director was asked to serve as a keynote speaker for the Project Alpha Empowerment Session, which was directed to young African-American males ages 14 to 24. The Executive Director shared the importance of having positive engagement with law enforcement officers, and the available resources to citizens of Knoxville if an individual experienced a negative encounter with a Knoxville Police Department officer. The discussion also outlined the consequences of assaulting another individual.
- March 5, 2019** The Executive Director and Chief Eve Thomas, Knoxville Police Department were asked to provide testimony during the Senate Judiciary Committee Hearing in Nashville, Tennessee. With the assistance of the City of Knoxville’s lobbyist and support of the City Mayor and Councilmembers, we were able to introduce an amendment to sustain subpoena powers for civilian oversight entities in the State of Tennessee. The amendment was discussed and approved by member of the Senate Judiciary Committee.
- March 11, 2019** The Executive Director served as a guest presenter to the newly hired KPD Recruit Class. The discussion topic was based on Civilian Oversight and PARC’s service to the City of Knoxville. Recruits were provided with information about PARC’s history and the process of investigating a citizen complaint. In addition, recruits were encouraged to serve as advocates for Civilian Oversight and community awareness.
- March 13, 2019** The Executive Director served as a guest on the WOZO-Lion Talk Radio Show, which highlights local community groups that are centered around community awareness and public safety. The discussion was based on PARC’s history and service to the City of Knoxville. In addition, the Executive Director shared about the importance of PARC and its service to the City of Knoxville.

March 28, 2019 The Executive Director, Neighborhood Coordinator of the Office of Neighborhoods, and members of the Knoxville Police Department conducted the inaugural Safety Series, which outlined safety awareness and crime prevention practices for community members. Attendees were informed about specific criminal activities that impact the North Knoxville community, and the Knoxville Police Department shared data to highlight areas of concern for the City of Knoxville. The series will continue throughout the City of Knoxville.

March 30, 2019 The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for the Save Our Sons event titled, “Positive Engagement with Law Enforcement”. The Executive Director shared information on “Knowing Your Rights” and the importance of building positive relationships with member of law enforcement.

Attendees were reminded if anyone would like PARC to speak to their organization, please call Clarence Vaughn at the PARC office, 865-215-3869. This information can also found in the Informational Brochure available at the sign-in table.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT

AUDIT OF DISCIPLINE PROCESS

The Committee audits all completed investigations from the Internal Affairs Unit of the Knoxville Police Department. The results of the first quarter audits were as follows:

Total of Cases Audited by the Police Advisory and Review Committee were (1) Internal Affairs Case and (2) Referral Action Forms:

Officers Disciplined	1
Civilian Employees Disciplined	0

<u>Disciplines Imposed</u>	<u>Number of Officers</u>	<u>Number of Civilian Employees</u>
Verbal Counseling	1	

The Police Advisory and Review Committee and the Executive Director concurred with Internal Affairs’s conclusions on each case reviewed. The Executive Director asked for additional information on two of the three cases reviewed. After reviewing the additional information provided, the Committee concurred with the findings of the Internal Affairs Unit.

AUDITS OF KPD POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

Reviewed the following ordinances, policies, and procedures as result of the Executive Director’s evaluation of the Internal Affairs Investigations and complaints brought to the Executive Director:

- General Order 1.36 (Harassment)
- General Order 1.5 (Authorized Weapons and Ammunition)
- General Order 1.60 (Response to Resistance)
- General Order 1.45 (Police Identification)
- General Order 4.11 (Seizures)
- General Order 4.16 (Missing Persons)
- General Order 4.6 (Documentation of Incident and Departmental Record-Keeping, Section IV)
- General Order 4.6 (Preliminary & Follow-Up Investigation Procedures, Section I)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.04 (Conformance to Laws)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.19 (Unbecoming Conduct)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.37 (Operating Vehicles)

- Standard Operating Procedure 1.39 (Arrest, Search, and Seizure)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.04 (Conduct – General)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.07 (Truthfulness)
- Standard Operating Procedure 3.00 (Courtesy)
- Standard Operating Procedure 4.00 (Identification Before Taking Police Action)

ADVOCACY (STRENGTHENING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CITIZENS AND THE KPD)

- The Executive Director continues to meet with members of the Knoxville Police Department’s Command Staff and Internal Affairs Unit on a regular basis to discuss concerns and best practices that will result in effective ways to improve relationships with community members.
- The Executive Director along with the assistance of the Knoxville Police Department conducts mediation session between concerned citizens and officers to discuss areas of concerns and best practices to mitigate reoccurrences of negative interactions.
- The Executive Director provides training to the Knoxville Police Department’s Recruit Class on the history of PARC and it services provided to the citizens of Knoxville. KPD Recruits are given information detailing the creation of PARC and the impact it has made on building relationships between the Knoxville Police Department and community members.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

- The Executive Director continues to meet with citizens and community groups to discuss concerns and complaints to develop plans for helpful resolutions. The resolutions are based on the areas of concern presented by community members and the information is shared with the appropriate agency or department involved.
- The Executive Director has served as a guest speaker, panelist, and host for topics that relate to community safety and crime prevention. The speaking engagements involve speaking on panels that are directed to discussing issues that impact marginalized communities. In addition, the engagements are geared towards ensuring that community members are aware of available resources to aid in their concerns.
- The Executive Director serves on the board of several organizations whom have a targeted approach of improving and enhancing community involvement in the City of Knoxville. In addition, a significant portion of the non-profit boards that the Executive Director serves on are focused on rehabilitation, crime prevention, and neighborhood safety.

NETWORKING

- The Executive Director along with representatives from the Knoxville Police Department, Community Relations Department, and Police Advisory and Review Committee met with Hamilton County Commissioners, City of Chattanooga Council Members, and the Hamilton County Sheriff to discuss Civilian Oversight and community engagement with law enforcement.
- The Executive Director and the Chief Eve Thomas of the Knoxville Police Department traveled to Nashville, Tennessee, to meet with representatives of the House Criminal Justice Sub-Committee and the Senate Judiciary Committee. The meetings focus was on educating legislators as to why they should vote against House Bill #658, and share the success of PARC and its strong relationship with the Knoxville Police Department.

Chairperson Mar reminded everyone that if they wished to speak at the meeting tonight during “Open Forum” to please sign up on the green sheet located at the sign-in table.

PARC SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

Audio/Video Subcommittee – Robbie Arrington

Of the (2) Referral Action Forms and (1) Internal Affairs Case reviewed by the PARC Audio/Video Subcommittee in the 1st Quarter, we submit the provided findings:

File #1 Referral Action Form

The officer's dashboard camera and audio equipment operated properly. The reviewed Referral Action Form involved dispatch wireless and in-car audio and visual recordings relating to the officer's involvement in the incident. The reviewed audio and visual recordings provided further detail into the initial complaint received.

File #2 IAU Case #18-2793

The Internal Affairs Case reviewed involved an incident that took place while the officer was off-duty. The provided audio recordings came by way of a 911 Dispatch Operator conversation with both involved parties. The reviewed video recording involved surveillance footage captured at a local gas station, which identified the location of each party involved during the incident.

File #3 Referral Action Form

The Referral Action Form reviewed did not provide any audio or visual recordings to observe. The interaction took place inside of the Knoxville Police Department Headquarters. However, the conversation between the involved parties was shared in a memorandum provided by the Knoxville Police Department.

SUMMARY

The Knoxville Police Department's General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment) details that Officers shall turn on their audio and video equipment when they are out of their patrol unit on a call-for-service in the event audio is needed to substantiate or assist with documentation of their law enforcement duties, i.e., domestic disturbance, etc. It should be remembered that the purpose of the in-car video equipment is to monitor all contacts with a person in the community in all situations possible.

Please note that the Knoxville Police Department requires Sergeants to review officers' audio and visual footage twice per month to ensure that their wireless microphones are operating properly.

RACIAL PROFILING SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT –

There was not any alleged racial profiling case received by PARC during the 1st Quarter.

General Order 1.41 Bias Based Policing

I. Policy

It is the policy of the Knoxville Police Department that we are committed to preserving the peace and maintaining order in the City of Knoxville by practicing bias-free policing and respecting the rights and dignity of all citizens.

II. Definition

Bias Based Profiling - The practice of stopping, detaining or searching a person based solely upon a common trait or a group that includes but is not limited to their race, color ethnicity, age, gender sexual orientation, religion, economic status or any other identifiable group characteristic.

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Quarter-to-Date Operations Report

Ms. Ann Barker reported on the quarterly totals of the 2019 cases, received, and reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period **January 1, 2019 to March 31, 2019**.

Total Cases for the Quarter	19
Cases Closed in the Quarter	18
Resolution of Cases Closed for the Quarter	
Executive Director	10
Mediation: Executive Director & KPD	1
Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	2
KPD	5
Total Cases Resolved	18
Total Cases Pending for the Quarter	
	1
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases Referred to IAU for the Quarter	1
IAU Completed Cases Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter	1
IAU Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter	2
IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases	0

PARC TRAINING SESSION: “KPD’s Use of Audio and Video Surveillance”

Ms. Julia Small, Knoxville Police Tech Services presented an overview of the “In Car Video System.” The in car video system was implemented by KPD in 1998. Why have a video system? It protects you, its vindicates, promotes public confidence, enhances training and promote positive behaviors. Video are stored (archived) for three years and is available on-line for 120 days. Over the past five years, there has been 17,655 video requests. The video system can be turned on manually by a power button or it is automatically triggered on when emergency lights are on, speed is over 80 mph or if the car is involved in a crash.

CASE MATTERS TO BE ADDRESSED BY THE COMMITTEE

Clarification was requested by PARC member Jared Croom as to the KPD policy on unauthorized weapons. Chief Thomas reported that there is an approved list of weapons. However, if you do not certify at the range with the weapon, you are not authorized to use. The officer involved in the incident was disciplined and the policy reviewed again with him.

CITIZENS ASKED TO APPEAR BEFORE PARC

Four citizens requested to appear before PARC. The citizens were Sherrie Raymond, Barbara Bridges, David Hayes and Constance M. Every. The citizens’ concerns focused on outreach efforts to encourage more citizens to report concerns to PARC.

COMMUNITY UPDATES

Director Vaughn introduced Debbie Sharp, Coordinator of Neighborhood Development for the City of Knoxville and encouraged citizens to utilize the resources this department provides. In addition, Director Vaughn shared information about an upcoming “Safety Workshop” in which PARC is partnering with the Officer of Neighborhoods that is scheduled to take place on June 24, 2019 at the Woodlawn Christian Church.

The meeting adjourned

Respectfully Submitted,
Clarence L. Vaughn III, Executive Director